

AGENDA ITEM NO.

COUNCIL MEETINGAPPROVED BYDEPARTMENT DIRECTORCITY MANAGER

January 30, 2007

FROM: JON R. RUIZ, Interim Public Works Director
Public Works Department

BY: AMBER ADAMS, Public Works Manager, Street Division
Public Works Department

SUBJECT: AWARD A REQUIREMENTS CONTRACT TO WEST COAST ARBORISTS, INC. OF
ANAHEIM, CALIFORNIA, FOR MAINTENANCE OF THE STREET TREE COMPONENT
OF THE MUNICIPAL FOREST RFP NO. 8844 (REBID)

KEY RESULT AREA

Customer Service

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the City Council award a three-year requirements contract with two one-year extensions in the amount of \$729,675.00 to West Coast Arborists, Inc. of Anaheim, California, for maintenance of the street tree component of the municipal forest.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Beginning in 1994, the City has contracted for tree trimming and removal services for the more than 200,000 trees located in City parkways and neighborhoods. The Department of Public Works, Street Maintenance Division, is seeking to establish a requirements contract for these services. Staff recommends award of a three-year requirements contract, with two one-year extensions, to West Coast Arborists, Inc. of Anaheim, California, in the amount of \$729,675.00. Funding for the contract is included in the FY07 budget. Purchases made in FY08 will be at contract prices and will be included in the proposed FY08 budget.

KEY OBJECTIVE BALANCE

The recommendation best balances the three Key Objectives of Customer Satisfaction, Employee Satisfaction, and prudent Financial Management. The recommendation allows for the most cost effective maintenance of the municipal forest which in turn increases customer satisfaction. Employee satisfaction is enhanced by having the resources available to timely address customer needs.

BACKGROUND

Beginning in 1994, the City has contracted for maintenance of the more than 200,000 trees located in City parkways and neighborhoods. The contract provides for tree and stump removal, scheduled and service requested tree trimming, tree planting, and related emergency tree services. The execution of a requirements contract establishes a firm price, secured through competitive bidding, for a specified time and allows the City to request these services as needed.

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

Award a Requirements Contract to West Coast Arborists, Inc.
of Anaheim, California, for the Maintenance of the Street Tree
Component of the Municipal Forest

January 30, 2007

Page 2

The RFP was prepared with adjusted quantities based on the annual averages of the services performed over the last two years plus the additional work anticipated through previously approved capital projects. An RFP was advertised in the Business Journal on November 22, 2006 to obtain proposals for a new contract. RFP proposal specifications were distributed to twelve potential proposers and information was posted on the City's website. A proposal conference was held on December 5, 2006, and representatives of several firms that perform tree services attended. One proposal was received and opened on December 14, 2006. The proposal received was from West Coast Arborist, the company that has previously held this contract.

The proposal was evaluated by a selection committee consisting of representatives from the State Center Community College District, the Parks Department, Public Works Department and Purchasing Division. The proposal was evaluated on the basis of cost and the ability of the proposer to meet the service level required in the contract. The committee reviewed the pricing of all bid items and felt the prices were generally competitive. Prices for some individual service are higher and some lower than the previous contract prices, but for those items that can be compared to the 2001 contract, overall the new pricing is approximately 25% lower.

In accordance with the Selection Committee's evaluation, staff recommends award of a requirements contract to West Coast Arborists Inc. of Anaheim, California (WCA). WCA submitted a responsible and responsive bid. WCA held the previous contract, maintains an office and equipment yard in Fresno exclusively to service the City's needs. WCA's service during the past thirteen years has been more than adequate. The City will derive the benefit of continued employment of existing WCA employees who are trained and experienced in the work to be done on this contract. Staff concurs with the selection committee's conclusion that West Coast Arborists Inc. provides the best value in meeting the interest of the City and the objectives of this project and, therefore, recommends award to them for maintenance of the street trees.

The Council may award a contract to West Coast Arborists of Anaheim, California. The contract will be in effect for three years from the date of the Notice to Proceed with provisions for two one-year extensions.

The Council may reject the proposal. If the proposal is rejected, the City will remain without a requirements contract for maintenance of street trees for approximately an additional ninety days.

FISCAL IMPACT

Funding for the contract is included in the FY07 budget. Purchases made in FY08 will be at contract prices and will be included in the proposed FY08 budget.

Awd Contract West Coast Arborists 1-23-07
aa/J/Staff Report Tree Contract

Attachments:

- Selection Committee Report
- Summary of Information Submitted by Proposers

**REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE FOR
MAINTENANCE OF THE STREET TREE COMPONENT
OF THE MUNICIPAL FOREST
RFP # 8844 (REBID)**

Introduction

Since 1994 the City has contracted for tree trimming and removal services. An RFP was advertised in the Business Journal on November 22, 2006 to obtain proposals for a new contract. RFP proposal specifications were distributed to twelve potential proposers and information was posted on the City's website. A proposal conference was held on December 5, 2006 and representatives of several firms that perform tree services attended. One proposal was received and opened on December 14, 2006. The proposal received was from West Coast Arborist, the company that has previously held this contract.

Several of the potential proposers were contacted about why they did not submit a proposal. One did not have the staff to handle such a large contract. Another was not willing at this time to commit the resources to establish a branch in this area and another said they were still busy with disaster recovery projects and did not have the time to put together a proposal.

Committee Members

Rick Katen, City of Fresno, PW, Tree Maintenance – Tree Program Specialist
Hilary Kimber, City of Fresno, PRCS – Parks Supervisor II
Glen Foth, State Center Community College District, - District Mgr., Grounds Services

Advisor

Amber Adams, City of Fresno, PW, Public Works Manager

Facilitator

Michael Brown, Senior Buyer, Purchasing

Evaluation by Committee

An independent committee convened to review the proposal submitted by West Coast Arborists for the subject maintenance contract and agreed that West Coast Arborists met the objectives of the RFP with a complete and thorough response package.

The committee evaluated West Coast Arborist's proposal overall, and then comparatively, in twelve (12) separate categories. These categories included capability to perform the work, qualifications, past experience, completeness of response,

qualifications of staff, prices offered, and the professional ability of management, and other factors. West Coast Arborists was acceptable in all responses and categories.

All of the references that were contacted reported that West Coast Arborist had performed the work extremely well and they were pleased with every aspect of their performance.

Financial information submitted by West Coast Arborist was sent to the City's Finance Department for review and it was found to be acceptable.

The last contract for street tree maintenance awarded had a Notice to Proceed issued on July 9, 2001. Since that time other services have been added to the contract and to the current RFP, so a full price comparison is not possible. The committee reviewed the pricing of all bid items and felt the prices were generally competitive. Prices for some individual service are higher and some lower than the previous contract prices, but for those items that can be compared to the 2001 contract, overall the new pricing is approximately 25% lower.

Committee members felt that West Coast Arborists is a professionally proven and stable organization with a fully-trained management and work staff, financial stability, and meets or exceeds every requirement of the RFP. The committee has determined that West Coast Arborist can provide the best service, response, and customer satisfaction for the City of Fresno now and for the foreseeable future.

Committee Recommendation

West Coast Arborists, Inc. has provided all of the information requested in the RFP and met all the requirements set in the RFP. After reviewing the proposal, the committee recommends that West Coast Arborists, Inc. should again be awarded the contract for maintenance of the street tree component of the municipal forest.

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 1

**FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR MAINTENANCE OF THE STREET TREE COMPONENT
OF THE MUNICIPAL FOREST**

RFP No. 8844
RFP Opening:12/14/06

PROPOSER'S (In alphabetical order)	TOTAL PROPOSAL AMOUNT
1. West Coast Arborists Inc. 5424 N Barcus Ave Fresno, CA 93722	\$729,675.00

Each proposer has agreed to allow the City one hundred twenty (120) days from date proposals were opened to accept or reject their proposal.

LISTING OF PROPOSERS

Page 2

FOR: REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR MAINTENANCE OF THE STREET TREE COMPONENT
OF THE MUNICIPAL FOREST

RFP No. 8844
RFP Opening: 12/14/06

DEPARTMENT CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION:

☒ Award a contract in the amount of \$ 729,675.00
to West Coast Arborists
in accordance with the Selection Committee recommendation.

☐ Reject all proposals. Reason:

Remarks:

Department Head Approval

Eden Ramirez

Title Asst. P&D Director

Date 1/5/07

☒ Approve Dept. Recommendation

☐ Approve GSD/Purchasing Recommendation

☐ Disapprove

☐ Disapprove

☐ See Attachment

GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

CITY MANAGER

Janet Smith 1/10/07
Purchasing Manager Date

Ben Chell 1/10/07
City Manager or Designee Date

Herbert 1/11/07
Director Date

CITY OF FRESNO
RFP MAINTENANCE OF THE STREET TREE COMPONENT
OF THE MUNICIPAL FOREST

BID FILE NO. 8844 (Rebid)

				West Coast Arborist					
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	SIZE CLASSES/ UNITS	QUANTITY	UNIT \$	TOTAL	UNIT \$	TOTAL	UNIT \$	TOTAL
1	TREE & STUMP REMOVAL	0.5"-1.9" DBH	10	\$ 40.00	\$ 400.00		\$ -		\$ -
2		2"-7" DBH	10	\$ 175.00	\$ 1,750.00		\$ -		\$ -
3		8"-15" DBH	75	\$ 375.00	\$ 28,125.00		\$ -		\$ -
4		16"-23" DBH	200	\$ 75.00	\$ 15,000.00		\$ -		\$ -
5		24"-48' DBH	75	\$ 500.00	\$ 37,500.00		\$ -		\$ -
6		49"-52" DBH	50	\$ 500.00	\$ 25,000.00		\$ -		\$ -
7		Over 52" DBH	30	\$ 500.00	\$ 15,000.00		\$ -		\$ -
SUBTOTAL				\$ 122,775.00		\$ -		\$ -	

1	TREE REMOVAL ONLY	1"-1.9 DBH	0	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-
2		8"-15" DBH	10	\$ 300.00	\$	3,000.00	\$	-
3		16"-23" DBH	15	\$ 300.00	\$	4,500.00	\$	-
4		24"-48' DBH	5	\$ 400.00	\$	2,000.00	\$	-
5		49"-52" DBH	2	\$ 400.00	\$	800.00	\$	-
5		Over 52" DBH	2	\$ 400.00	\$	800.00	\$	-
SUBTOTAL				\$	11,100.00	\$	-	

1	STUMP ONLY REMOVAL	5"-7" DBH	5	\$ 125.00	\$ 625.00	\$	-	\$	-
2		8"-15" DBH	15	\$ 125.00	\$ 1,875.00	\$	-	\$	-
3		16"-23" DBH	130	\$ 25.00	\$ 3,250.00	\$	-	\$	-
4		24"-48' DBH	50	\$ 125.00	\$ 6,250.00	\$	-	\$	-
5		49"-52" DBH	10	\$ 125.00	\$ 1,250.00	\$	-	\$	-
6		Over 52" DBH	5	\$ 125.00	\$ 625.00	\$	-	\$	-
SUBTOTAL				\$	13,875.00	\$	-	\$	-

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	SIZE CLASSES/ UNITS	QUANTITY	West Coast Arborist		TOTAL	UNIT \$	TOTAL	UNIT \$	TOTAL
				UNIT \$	TOTAL					
GEO-BASE TREE TRIMS										
1	Non-palm trees	Climb 61' +	100	\$ 275.00	\$	27,500.00		\$	-	\$
2	Non-palm trees	Tower 46'-60'	400	\$ 100.00	\$	40,000.00		\$	-	\$
3	Non-palm trees	Lift (19'-45')	3000	\$ 60.00	\$	180,000.00		\$	-	\$
4	Non-palm trees	Ground <3 & <19	1500	\$ 25.00	\$	37,500.00		\$	-	\$
5	Non-palm trees	Young >3 & >19	1000	\$ 1.00	\$	1,000.00		\$	-	\$
SUBTOTAL				\$ 286,000.00				\$		\$
								-		-

SERVICE REQUEST TREE TRIMS										
1	Non-palm trees	Climb 61' +	50	\$ 350.00	\$	17,500.00		\$	-	\$
2	Non-palm trees	Tower 46'-60'	75	\$ 225.00	\$	16,875.00		\$	-	\$
3	Non-palm trees	Lift (19'-45')	100	\$ 100.00	\$	10,000.00		\$	-	\$
4	Non-palm trees	Ground <3 & <19	50	\$ 45.00	\$	2,250.00		\$	-	\$
5	Non-palm trees	Young >3 & >19	10	\$ 20.00	\$	200.00		\$	-	\$
6	Washingtonia robusta		100	\$ 50.00	\$	5,000.00		\$	-	\$
7	Washingtonia filifera		50	\$ 200.00	\$	10,000.00		\$	-	\$
8	Phoenix canariensis		50	\$ 200.00	\$	10,000.00		\$	-	\$
SUBTOTAL						\$ 71,825.00		\$	-	\$

1	Clearance Trim	per tree	100	\$ 30.00	\$	3,000.00		\$	-	\$
2	Complete Geobase Inventory	per tree site	20000	\$ -	\$	-		\$	-	\$
3	Incomplete Geobase Inventory	per tree site	250	\$ -	\$	-		\$	-	\$
4	Complete Inventory Using GPS	per tree site	0	\$ 4.00	\$	-		\$	-	\$
5	Restaking	per tree	25	\$ 24.00	\$	600.00		\$	-	\$
6	Hole Drilling	existing hole	300	\$ 5.00	\$	1,500.00		\$	-	\$
7	Marking Planting Locations	per site	0	\$ 50.00	\$	-		\$	-	\$
8	Tree Planting	15 gallon	700	\$ 20.00	\$	14,000.00		\$	-	\$
9	Tree Planting	24 inch box	10	\$ 100.00	\$	1,000.00		\$	-	\$
10	Crew Rental	per hour/man	5000	\$ 40.00	\$	200,000.00		\$	-	\$
11	Emergency Service	per hour	50	\$ 80.00	\$	4,000.00		\$	-	\$
SUBTOTAL						\$ 224,100.00		\$	-	\$

TOTAL PROPOSAL PRICE

\$729,675.00

\$0.00

\$0.00